

**Florida National Register Review Board Building
R. A. Gray Building, Room 307
Tallahassee, Florida
August 9, 2018
Meeting Minutes**

Commission Members Present In-Person: Dr. Clifford Smith, Chair; Dr. J. Michael Francis; Ms. Marion Almy

Commission Members Present via Webinar: Ms. Ellen J. Uguccioni, Vice-Chair; Mr. Rick Gonzalez

Commission Members Unable to Attend: None

Florida Department of State Officials and Staff Present: Timothy A. Parsons, Ph.D., Division Director and State Historic Preservation Officer; Alissa Slade Lotane, Bureau Chief, Bureau of Historic Preservation and Deputy SHPO; Susanne Hunt, Outreach Programs Supervisor; Ruben Acosta, Survey and Registration Supervisor; Chip Birdsong, Supervisor/GIS Administrator; Max Adriel Imberman, Historic Preservationist; Michael Hart, State Historical Marker Coordinator; Megan McDonald, Certified Local Government Coordinator; Andrew Waber, Historic Preservationist; Carl Shiver, Ph.D., Historic Preservationist; Laura Bright, Historic Preservation Grants Specialist; Eric Case, Historic Preservation Grants Specialist; Timothy Knoepke, Historic Preservation Grants Specialist; Ginny Jones, Architectural Historian

Florida Department of State Officials Present via Webinar:

Guests Present: Randy Jaye, Linda Manley, Ken Rockwell, Susan Campbell Hatler, Simone Arelia Hatler, Joanna Campbell, Michelina Shulze, Annie Booth, Melissa Wyllie, Richard Heisenbottle.

Guests Present via Webinar: Warren Adams, Sarah Cody, Christie Fitz-Patrick, Jeremy Heiker, Sarah Liko, David Martinez-Delgado, Genevieve Orr, Max Pearl, Carmen Pelaez, Courtney Robinson, Howard Rogut, Jan Wyatt, Amy Zongotita, Colleen Stovall, Gloriana Calhoun, Robert Ingram, John Norton, Penny Davis

I. Call to Order and Roll Call

The meeting was called to order by Dr. Smith at 1:35 p.m. All board members were present.

II. Introduction of Commission, Staff, and Guests

Commission, staff, and guests introduced themselves.

III. Adoption of Agenda

Ms. Almy made the motion to approve the agenda for the meeting. Dr. Francis seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

IV. Remarks by Chairperson on Purpose of Meeting

Dr. Smith described the purpose and process of the National Register Review Board.

V. Approval of Minutes from November 30, 2017 Meeting

Ms. Almy made the motion to approve the minutes from the May 24, 2018 meeting. Mr. Gonzalez seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

VI. Director's Comments

Dr. Parsons thanked the National Register Review Board for the time and effort they dedicated to the meeting, and welcomed Dr. Francis to his first meeting as a member of the board. He discussed the role the public plays in the National Register review process and read out public comment guidelines, primarily revolving around respect.

VII. Review of Nomination Proposals

A. P. K. Yonge House, Pensacola, Escambia County was presented by Mr. Acosta. The building is being proposed for listing in the National Register at the state and local level under Criterion A for Education and Criterion B for its association with P.K. Yonge and Julien Chandler Yonge. It also being proposed for listing under Criterion C at the local level for Architecture and as the work of a master architect, Chandler Cox Yonge. The period of significance extends from its date of construction in 1910 until 1944, when the historical library was donated to the University of Florida and J.C. Yonge relocated to Gainesville. The home was at one time the repository for the largest private collection of Florida historical materials in the world, drawing researchers from all over the country. The collection of historical materials was donated to the University of Florida in 1944, forming the core of the university's renowned P.K. Yonge Library of Florida History collection. The man most responsible for gathering these materials, J.C. Yonge, also played a crucial role in the revival of the Florida Historical Society and in the publication of the Florida Historical Quarterly, which he edited for many years, including while residing at the Yonge House.

The house is also a locally significant example of Arts and Crafts Style architecture. This is perhaps best exemplified in the low-pitched, overhanging roof and prominent brackets; the rough-hewn stone chimney and fireplace; and prominent interior with custom built and in-built wood furnishings. The house is also the first project of locally significant master architect Chandler Cox Yonge, son of P.K. Yonge. Chandler Yonge became a prolific architect throughout the State of Florida and was noted in Pensacola for a number of prominent residential commissions of lumber magnates and commercial and governmental commissions such as the Rex Theatre, the Pensacola Police Headquarters, the Pensacola News Journal building, the Pensacola Bowling Center, the Pensacola Naval Hospital, and the Escambia County Jail.

Susan Campbell, the owner's daughter and applicant for nomination, spoke in favor of the nomination.

Dr. Francis congratulated the owners of the property on the home, which he described as "stunning." He said that the proposal was beautifully written and said that it was one of the best among nominations reviewed for this meeting.

Ms. Almy addressed Ms. Campbell and her family, saying that their dedication to the property was admirable.

Mr. Gonzalez described the brackets of the house as “out of this world” and said that he would love to visit someday.

Ms. Uguccioni questioned staff about the distinction between the local and state levels of significance. Mr. Acosta clarified that the state level of significance applies to the house’s use as a library of Florida history.

A motion was made by Mr. Gonzalez to forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under Criteria A, B, and C at the local and state levels. Dr. Francis seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

- B. Holden House, Bunnell, Flagler County Acosta** was presented by Mr. Acosta. The district is being nominated to the National Register Criterion C: Architecture as an excellent example of an early 20th Century Craftsman bungalow house. The Craftsman style was a significant nationwide residential architectural style that developed as a vernacular expression of the Arts and Crafts movement. Popularized by magazines such as Gustav Stickley’s *Craftsman* and by the house catalogues of mail order companies such as Sears, Roebuck and Company and the Aladdin House Company, the style was found across the United States and incorporated character-defining features such as the extensive use of wood, exposed rafter tails, wood brackets, battered (tapered) columns, multi-light over single light windows, and the expression of craftsmanship in design and components—even though they were mass produced by industry. The bungalow house type was equally common in the period and was characterized by a compact arrangement of rooms, often one to one-and-a-half stories tall, with wide porches on one or more sides, front or side gabled roofs of varying slopes, and prominent gable or shed roofed dormers. The period of significance for the Holden House is 1918, the year of construction, to circa 1940, the approximate date of the sunroom addition.

Randy Jay, of the Flagler County Historical Society, gave a bit more information on the history of the property. He stated that the house functioned as a central area for Bunnell’s black community in the era of segregation. He described it as a “historical gem.” Mr. Jay discussed the lengths taken to preserve the building over the years, through natural damage and decay. He described the building as in immaculate condition and stated his hope that it will stay that way, in its role as a county-owned museum.

Mr. Gonzalez said that the building has always been striking to him in his previous visits to Bunnell, and said that the owners should install a new picket fence to match the one seen in historic photos. He also stated his hope that the front-gable mosaic would be restored. He described the nomination as well-prepared. Mr. Jay responded to these comments by saying that the mosaic materials are still in the property of the building’s ownership, and that they are trying to figure out how to restore it. Mr. Gonzalez recommended that they apply for a historic preservation grant for this project.

Dr. Francis asked staff how the National Register listing would impact future restorations on the building. Mr. Acosta stated that the National Register program is primarily honorary, and would not impact this type of repair work. Dr. Parsons stated that the National Register does not stop property owners from doing any type of work upon their properties.

A motion was made by Ms. Almy to forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Ms. Uguccioni seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

- C. Bradenton Woman's Club, Bradenton, Manatee County** was presented by Mr. Acosta. The building is being nominated to the National Register under Criteria A and C in the areas of Social History and Architecture at the local level. It has played a significant role in the cultural, social and civic history of the city of Bradenton and Manatee County. The Colonial Revival style building was constructed in 1921, designed by architect Fred W. Kermode, who also designed the Palmetto Woman's Club in 1930, which was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on March 6, 1986. For a number of years, the Woman's Club was the only public facility large enough to accommodate the many diversified needs of the community. The period of significance for the Bradenton Woman's Club is approximately from 1923 to 1968, covering the period of its greatest activity in serving the city of Bradenton. The building has undergone only minor alterations since its completion in 1921 and has been restored from the damage done to the building by Hurricane Irma which struck Florida on September 10, 2017. The use of the Colonial Revival style for the design of the building was unusual for the Florida Boom period of the 1920s when the Mediterranean Revival style was popular for public buildings as well as residences. The clubhouse contributes to the CLUBHOUSES OF FLORIDA'S WOMAN'S CLUBS Multiple Property Submission under the Florida Land Boom, 1921-1926 Historic Context and the F.1 Property Type: Clubhouses.

Mr. Gonzalez stated that, after looking at historic photographs of the building, he feels that the roof replacement on the building takes away from the integrity of the building.

Dr. Francis expressed concerns about the impact of the damage to the building on its integrity.

Ms. Almy said that, while buildings can get damaged, much of the damage on this building can be reverted, and that this damage to integrity should not prevent it from being listed.

A motion was made by Ms. Almy to forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Dr. Francis seconded. The motion was approved 4-1, with Mr. Gonzalez opposed.

- D. Bacardi Buildings Complex, Miami, Miami-Dade County** was presented by Mr. Acosta. The building is being nominated to the National Register under Criterion C in the areas of Architecture and Art at the local level. The period of significance of these buildings ranges from 1963, when the Bacardi Imports Tower was constructed, to 1973, when the Bacardi Imports Administration Annex building was built. They are also eligible under Criteria Consideration G. The Bacardi buildings are iconic examples of mid-century modern International-style architecture, notable for their uses of steel and glass, each featuring imaginative cantilevered overhangs as the bulk of the building. They are each emblazoned with artistic products, with the 1963 tower decorated with over 28,000 *azulejo* tiles painted and assembled by Brazilian artist Francisco Brennand. The Bacardi Imports Administration Annex building's four walls are entirely defined by stained-glass windows manufactured by French artists Gabriel and Jacques Loire based upon a painting by German artist Johannes

Dietz. The buildings are notable for the way that they embrace international influences within architecture and art to create visually impressive works.

Mr. Hernandez spoke over the telephone to say how pleased he was with the nomination, agreeing that it satisfied Criteria Consideration G. He stated that this nomination as well as other recent nominations help to support the cultural and artistic narrative of Cuban immigration in Miami.

Mr. Heisenbottle also spoke in support of the nomination, stating that his firm wrote the local historic designation of the building. He agreed that the building is exceptional in terms of architecture and artistry. He stated that no other building in Miami deserved historic listing as much as the Bacardi Building Complex.

Mr. Gonzalez opened the board discussion of the building by stating that the complex has a very strong sense of feeling, but questioned why the building was only being recommended for listing as significant at the state level. Dr. Francis agreed, and wondered why it was only being recommended for listing under Criterion C, thinking that the historic narrative of the building would support Criterion A. Mr. Acosta stated that the primary significance of the property comes from its architecture. He said that "use does not equal significance," that the presence of the Bacardi corporation doesn't necessarily qualify it for significance under Criterion A. Mr. Acosta said that, while information may exist that can justify listing under Criterion A, the SHPO didn't have access to that information at the time of writing. Ms. Almy pointed out that, in terms of protection, additional criteria or higher levels of significance are of no benefit. Mr. Imberman, the nomination's author, said that of the potential areas of significance for Criterion A, Commerce might be possible, but that access to the necessary research materials would be very difficult to gain. Mr. Waber said that, after a resource is listed, the nomination can always be modified to add areas of significance or change the level of significance to state or national.

Mr. Gonzalez said that the Bacardi Buildings Complex should be regarded as a site more than just a pair of buildings or a single building, and that the site has held up very well with a well-preserved setting and context. He said that the site was being sold short by only pursuing the local level of significance.

Ms. Uguccioni agreed with Mr. Gonzalez about the areas and level of significance. She said that Criterion A would be appropriate under the areas of Commerce and Social History, due to its role within the Cuban diaspora to Miami.

Mr. Adams, City of Miami Historic Preservation Officer, stated his office's support for the nomination.

A motion was made by Mr. Gonzalez to forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places with the recommendation that the Florida SHPO pursue the listing at a higher level of significance. Ms. Almy seconded. The motion was approved 4-1. Immediately after the vote, Ms. Uguccioni asked to include a recommendation of Criterion A, which Mr. Gonzalez agreed to. Ms. Almy pointed out that the vote had already occurred. Robert's Rules were consulted to conclude whether or

not such an amendment to a motion could be added after a vote. Ms. Uguccioni voted against the nomination because it did not include Criterion A.

- E. Coconut Grove Playhouse, Miami, Miami-Dade County** was presented by Mr. Acosta. The building is being nominated to the National Register under Criterion A in the area of Entertainment and Recreation, and Criterion C in the area of Architecture for its Mediterranean Revival façade at the local level. The period of significance consists of 1927, when the building was originally constructed, and then extends from 1955, when oilman George Engle purchased a 1927 movie theater aiming to restore and convert it into a world-class playhouse, to 1970, when theatrical producer Zev Buffman sold the theater and ended its golden age. The Coconut Grove Playhouse is a locally significant example of Mediterranean Revival architecture, and it was designed and renovated by two generations of legendary architects. The playhouse was originally designed as a movie theater by the architectural firm of Kiehnel and Elliott for a 1927 opening, and it was converted into a playhouse by prolific Modernist architect Alfred Browning Parker. The building is also a local landmark, a point of pride for the Coconut Grove community, as well as having been an important economic and cultural presence in downtown Coconut Grove, as well as Greater Miami in general.

Dr. Parsons reminded those present and over the phone to keep their comments limited to the potential National Register listing, and not to talk about other topics related to the building.

Mr. Heisenbottle, historic preservation architect, spoke about his support for the National Register listing of the Coconut Grove Playhouse, but addressed his concerns about some of the specific language used in the architectural description, most notably in terms of the auditorium area and its proscenium arch. He also provided high-quality photographs for use in an amended version of the nomination. He recommended classifying the building under Criterion C as the work of master Miami architects Kiehnel and Elliott.

Ms. Wyllie, Executive Director, Florida Trust for Historic Preservation, spoke in favor of the nomination.

Ms. Pelaez, Miami resident, spoke and recommended expanding the period of significance through 2006 due to the many prominent actors, playwrights, and directors who performed or had their work performed there.

Mr. Hernandez, historic preservation architect, noted the improvements to the nomination since the last time it was presented. He said that the Criteria used and the period of significance were appropriate, but that he still doubted the overall integrity of the building due to the many additions and subtractions the building had experienced since the period of significance ended.

Mr. Rogut, Miami resident, stated that he supported the nomination, as an experienced contractor of historic properties.

Ms. Stovall, a Coconut Grove resident, said that the Coconut Grove Playhouse was the heart of her neighborhood. She described it as a significant landmark and a local treasure of the community.

Ms. Calhoun, another Coconut Grove resident, spoke of the national reputation the playhouse held as a breeding ground of excellent theater. She said that in New York the Coconut Grove Playhouse is respected as a place actors and directors liked to work and perform.

Mr. Ingram, another longtime Coconut Grove resident, spoke in favor of the Coconut Grove Playhouse as a historic resource representing Coconut Grove's culture and history.

Mr. Norton, Miami resident, described the Coconut Grove Playhouse as the "Sydney Opera House of Coconut Grove." He stated that it was the last Mediterranean Revival building in Coconut Grove¹ and is very significant.

Mr. Pearl, Coconut Grove Playhouse preservation advocate, spoke of the loss of historic resources Miami has experienced, and situated the playhouse within its historical and cultural context.

Ms. Davis, who worked at the Coconut Grove Playhouse during the period of significance, spoke of the significant theatrical events that had occurred at the building during and since her tenure. She said that she wanted "the stage to stay as it is."

Ms. Almy asked Mr. Heisenbottle to expand upon his earlier comments. He described the holes in the nomination description as being "wide enough to drive a truck through." Mr. Acosta thanked Mr. Heisenbottle for his photographs and said that the SHPO is willing and eager to incorporate greater descriptions of the interior with the information gained from the new photographs. Dr. Smith encouraged the board to include these changes as part of the motion for the nomination.

Dr. Francis thanked the public for their comments and said that he had no reservations about supporting the nomination's listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

Mr. Gonzalez described the building as being made of two parts, the theater section and the commercial façade section. He spoke against the current local plans to demolish the auditorium section of the building and preserve the commercial section as being against the spirit of preservation. He compared the building to the Palm Beach Courthouse, which was successfully restored after some significant alterations disrupted the significant interior spaces.

Ms. Ugucioni said she had studied this building in great depth, and described it as a key element of Coconut Grove architecture. She spoke about the successive changes to the building over the decades as impacting its integrity. She wondered to what point the building was being restored. Ms. Ugucioni said that the original Kiehnel and Elliott design was obliterated by Parker's mid-century additions, and that Parker's design has also been

¹ There are multiple National Register-listed Mediterranean Revival properties in Coconut Grove.

damaged. She was not convinced by the argument that the interiors could be successfully restored to an earlier appearance.

Dr. Smith thanked the public for their comments.

Dr. Francis asked whether or not the lack of architectural significance within the nomination for the building's interior would disqualify the interior from National Register protections. Mr. Acosta clarified that the National Register protections would apply to the entire building.

A motion was made by Ms. Almy to forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places with the recommendation that the requested edits to the description be added. Dr. Francis seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

- F. **Umbrella House, Sarasota, Sarasota County** was presented by Mr. Acosta. The building is being nominated to the National Register under Criterion C in the area of architecture, as it embodies the distinctive characteristics of American modernist construction as applied to a Florida beach house. Further, it is probably the most ambitious work undertaken by Paul Rudolph in the early 1950s, and it is on the basis, primarily, of this commission and other Florida beach houses that he was accorded the Outstanding Young Architect Award at an international competition in Sao Paolo, Brazil in 1954 and that *Time Magazine* in 1956 listed Rudolph among "modern architects whose contribution has been significant." It stated, "Paul Rudolph, 37, fast rising, Harvard-trained comer whose reputation is based on his self-styled 'structural-exhibitionist' Florida houses." In addition, the house possesses high artistic value. The residence contributes to the ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES OF THE SARASOTA SCHOOL OF ARCHITECTURE Multiple Property Submission under The Influence of New Architects, 1953-1959 Historic Context and the F.1 Property Type: Residential Buildings.

Dr. Smith recused himself from the discussion of the Umbrella House because he was involved in getting the nomination approved at the local level.

Ms. Almy spoke in favor of the nomination, having visited the house and having taken a tour.

Mr. Gonzalez said that he was also on that tour, and that he wished he had known that the house's titular umbrella was a reconstruction. He said that the reconstruction could perhaps serve as a future example for the Coconut Grove Playhouse.

Dr. Francis said that the nomination was well written.

Ms. Uguccioni spoke in favor of the nomination, noting the significance of Paul Rudolph within the state of Florida.

A motion was made by Mr. Gonzalez to forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Dr. Francis seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

G. Green Mound, Ponce Inlet, Volusia County was presented by Mr. Acosta. The building is being nominated under Criterion D in the area of Prehistoric Archeology for the information it has yielded and for its potential to yield further information at the local and state levels. The site holds a rich history of the prehistoric Florida Indians who inhabited the site for hundreds of years. Archaeological studies of the mound date artifacts to the St. Johns period (500 BC - 1565 AD). Archaeological studies of the mound show that people during the St. Johns I period (500 BC - 800 AD) occupied the site year-round, while in the St. Johns II period (800 AD -1565 AD) people may have occupied the site seasonally. Thus, the mound is an excellent representation of the St. Johns Period, offering a comparative understanding of the St. Johns I and II periods.

Ms. Zengotita, Cultural Service Manager for the Town of Ponce Inlet, spoke in favor of the nomination.

Dr. Francis offered this nomination an “enthusiastic endorsement,” and said he felt that it should be listed at a state level of significance.

A motion was made by Ms. Almy to forward the nomination to the National Park Service for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Dr. Francis seconded. The motion was approved unanimously.

VIII. Other Business

Mr. Acosta discussed the nominations and delistings which have been approved by the National Park Service since the last meeting. He discussed the status of two nominations which were returned by National Park Service (Mound House and The Grove) and talked about the corrections that will be undertaken by staff to gain NPS approval. The Grove will be presented to the National Register Review Board at the February meeting.

IX. Public Comment

No public comments were made.

X. Motion to Adjourn

Ms. Almy moved to adjourn. The meeting ended at 5:02 p.m.

Chair, National Register Review Board

Date

State Historic Preservation Officer

Date